



Mailing Address:

PO Box 3547
Saratoga Springs, NY 12866
Phone: 518.899.2608
Fax: 512.777.5045

Regional Offices:

Richmond, VA
Boston, MA
Portland, ME

10/27/2021

Mr. Steve Boisvert
Director of Civil Facilities
McFarland Johnson

Re: Port of Albany Marmen/Welcon Manufacturing SDEIS Correctness Review/SEQR Compliance Review – Camoin Associates Response

Dear Steve:

Please find Camoin Associates' responses to questions (numbered 1 and 2 below) regarding the economic and fiscal impact analysis that was completed on the generic Port of Albany Expansion Project. Note that the impact analysis was conducted on generic development concepts and did/does not reflect the specific end users that have since been identified for the site.

1. Confirm that the conclusions of the school district impact assessment remain valid. The Camoin Associates analysis concluded: *"As a purely industrial development, the Project will not directly generate any new school aged children who will be enrolled in the District and therefore no new costs to the district attributable to the Project are anticipated."* However, recent submittals have indicated 300+ jobs are expected to be created by the wind tower manufacturing plant, which should expect to indirectly generate new families moving to the Town to live. What school district would these families reside in and what is the expected new student enrollment associated with the creation of these 300+ jobs? How will new revenue generated (directly and indirectly) from the project support the increased costs associated with new enrollment in the Town?

New direct and indirect jobs will be substantially filled by workers living outside the Town of Bethlehem and Bethlehem Central School District.

- Based on the most recent data available from the U.S. Census Bureau OnTheMap, only 20.1% of jobs within the Town of Bethlehem are currently filled by residents of the Town of Bethlehem.
- However, the portion of "Goods Producing" industry jobs (including manufacturing) in the Town of Bethlehem filled by residents of the Town of Bethlehem is even smaller with only 12.3% of these jobs currently occupied by town residents. This is the industry category in which wind tower manufacturing at the port would fall within.
- Furthermore, the proportion of Goods Producing industry jobs filled by Town Residents has been declining. Over the past 10 years, from 2008 through 2018, the proportion dropped from 16.4% to 13.4%. At the same time, the number of jobs in this industry within the Town of Bethlehem has increased from 1,434 jobs to 1,657 jobs (an increase of 223 jobs). This trend suggests that jobs in this industry category in the Town of

Bethlehem are substantially and increasingly being filled by workers residing outside of the Town of Bethlehem.

Those employed in new direct and indirect jobs will be largely priced out of the Town of Bethlehem’s housing market.

- According to Realtor.com, the median sale price in the Town of Bethlehem was \$318,000 in September 2021. The median sale price in the Town peaked in May 2021 at \$380,000.
- To afford a median priced home in the Town of Bethlehem of \$318,000, a household would need an annual income of approximately \$90,000. According to Emsi, the average earnings for production occupations in Albany County is only \$43,341. For single-earning households this translates into an affordable home value of approximately \$155,000. Only 18 houses in the Town of Bethlehem sold for \$155,000 or less in the previous 12 months (October 2020 through October 2021).

Bethlehem Central School District has capacity to absorb new students with nominal cost impacts.

- The Bethlehem Central School District’s current enrollment of 4,336 (according to the NYSED Student Information Repository System), is significantly below recent and historic enrollment figures. In the 2006-07 School Year, the district had student enrollment of 5,182 (846 more students than at present day). Enrollment has been steadily declining since the 2006-07 including decreased enrollment in consecutive years from 2016-17 through the 2019-20 school year.
- Therefore, the School District has adequate facilities and capacity to absorb new students without significant new costs.
- Any increase in costs associated with new children living in the District as a result of the Project are expected to be nominal and insignificant relative to the projected increase in property tax revenues received by the district as a result of the development.

2. Confirm the conclusion of the off-site property tax revenue generation analysis, which states: *“approximately 90% of the economic impacts of new development will occur within the Town of Bethlehem.”* With Marmen/Welcon as the identified tenant for wind tower manufacturing, is this projected 90% still valid? Is this 90% associated with supply chain businesses or other businesses locating in the Town? If so, please identify the type of businesses expected to locate in Town, with estimated industry needs for infrastructure and zoning.

- Updated economic impact analysis modeling based on the proposed wind tower manufacturing use indicates that 52% of the Countywide economic impact of the project will occur in the Town of Bethlehem based on jobs. Assuming 320 on-site jobs, the total job impact to the Town of Bethlehem would be 358 jobs compared to 684 jobs to Albany County. A total of 38 indirect jobs will be created in the Town of Bethlehem compared to 364 indirect jobs created in Albany County.

10/27/2021

Mr. Steve Boisvert

Port of Albany Marmen/Welcon Manufacturing SDEIS Correctness Review/SEQR Compliance Review – Camoin Associates
Response

Page 3 of 4

- The economic impact to the town is realized at existing businesses within the Town of Bethlehem and does not include any businesses that may relocate to the Town in the future. Indirectly impacted businesses within the Town are primarily within the following industries according to Emsi:
 - Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services (7 jobs)
 - Transportation and Warehousing (5 jobs)
 - Government (5 jobs)
 - Other Services (3 jobs)
 - Finance and Insurance (4 jobs)
 - Real Estate and Rental and Leasing (3 Jobs)
- The aforementioned impacts will occur at already existing businesses in the Town of Bethlehem and therefore do not impact the need for infrastructure and zoning.

Please do not hesitate to reach out with any questions regarding this information.

Sincerely,

Rachel Selsky
Vice President
Camoin Associates

Dan Stevens
Senior Project Manager
Camoin Associates

10/27/2021

Mr. Steve Boisvert

Port of Albany Marmen/Welcon Manufacturing SDEIS Correctness Review/SEQR Compliance Review – Camoin Associates
Response

Page 4 of 4

Mr. Steve Boisvert

Mr. Steve Boisvert